DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 314 005 HE 023 118

TITLE Our Common Commitment. Enhancing Ethnic Minority Integration and Achievement in Arizona's Universities.
INSTITUTION Arizona Board of Regents, Phoenix.
PUB DATE Sep 89
NOTE 28p.
AVAILABLE FROM Arizona Board of Regents, 3030 N. Central Ave., Phoenix, AZ 85012.
PUB TYPE Reports - Evaluative/Feasibility (142)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Academic Persistence; *Access to Education; Accountability; College Admission; College Attendance; College Bound Students; College Faculty; College Students; Dropouts; Equal Education; Higher Education; *Minority Groups; Outreach Programs; Responsibility; *School Holding Power; Student Attrition; Student Financial Aid; Student Recruitment
IDENTIFIERS *Arizona

ABSTRACT

A report and recommendations of the Arizona Board of Regents' Ad Hoc Committee on University Access and Retention focuses on the enhancement of ethnic minority integration and achievement in Arizona's universities. Eight sections cover: introduction (the challenge for Arizona's universities); House Bill 2108; early outreach (linkages and coordination with the kindergarten-12 system and community colleges); minority student recruitment; minority student retention (e.g., minority student graduate rates will not improve greatly until the Board of Regents and universities refine their accountability mechanisms); accountability; an ongoing dialogue (a mechanism must be developed assuring regular, ongoing, meaningful communication among the board, the universities, and representatives of minorities); and future studies by the Board of Regents. Eight appendices provide information on: student financial aid trust fund policy; new Arizona University (AU) system admissions policy; amended AU teacher education degree programs and admissions policy; inventory of AU outreach programs; selected recommendations of the Regents' Task Force on Excellence, Efficiency, and Competitiveness; AU student cohort study; AU admissions/graduation rates; and "Use and Recommendations Regarding Achievement Tests" (Carlos Velez-Ibanez and David Berliner). (SM)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED314005

OUR COMMON COMMITMENT

Enhancing Ethnic Minority Integration and Achievement in Arizona's Universities

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Arizona Board of Regents

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

HE 023 118

AD HOC COMMITTEE ON UNIVERSITY ACCESS AND RETENTION

Esther Capin, Chair
Nogales

Edith Auslander
Subcommittee Chair
Tucson

Andrew Hurwitz
Subcommittee Chair
Phoenix

C. Diane Bishop
Phoenix

Donald Bliss
Phoenix

Ray Clarke
Tucson

George Evans
Phoenix

Rachel Frazier
Tucson

Joyce Geyser
Phoenix

The Hon. Jim Green
Tucson

Alfredo Gutierrez
Phoenix

The Hon. Jaime Gutierrez
Phoenix

The Hon. Art Hamilton
Phoenix

The Hon. Jack Jewitt
Phoenix

John Lewis
Phoenix

Larry L'Heureux
Flagstaff

Dr. Wayne McGrath
Phoenix

Patrick McWhorter
Tempe

Diego Navarette
Tucson

Danny Ortega
Phoenix

Matt Ortega
Tempe

Marvin Perry
Phoenix

Dr. Richard C. Richardson, Jr
Tempe

The Hon. Pete Rios
Phoenix

Dr. Linda Shadiow
Flagstaff

The Hon. Robert Usdane
Phoenix

Dr. Carlos Velez-Ibanez
Tucson

The Hon. Carolyn Walker
Phoenix

The Hon. Joe Washington
Flagstaff

The Hon. Earl Wilcox
Phoenix

Dr. Carol Wilson
Phoenix

Ora Lee Wong
Tucson

Table of Contents

Preface	2
Introduction	4
House Bill 2108	6
Early Outreach	8
Minority Student Recruitment	13
Minority Student Retention to Graduation	17
Accountability	20
An Ongoing Dialogue	22
Future Studies By The Board of Regents	23
Appendix	24

A Report And Recommendations of
The Regents' Ad Hoc Committee on
University Access and Retention

September 1989

Cover Photo By
University Media Systems
Arizona State University

Preface

In the fall of 1988, the Arizona Board of Regents established the Ad Hoc Committee on University Access and Retention. The formation of the Committee continued the momentum created by the passage of HB2108. Enactment of this legislation was achieved through the concerted efforts of the Governor and some members of the Legislature, who are themselves ethnic minorities. This bill allocated $2.5 million to the universities for programs of recruitment and retention of students from under-represented groups. The Board took this action because it believes that the number of students from under-represented groups who enroll, attend and graduate from Arizona's universities will increase significantly only through the committed, collective efforts of the Board, the community at large, the Legislature, and the universities' faculty, administrators, staff and students. The Board also recognized that the K-12 system and the community colleges as well as community-based organizations and the business community have significant roles to play in the success of university efforts. In the context of these challenges, the Board asked the Committee to examine new, creative approaches to enable all the parties to renew their common commitment to enhance ethnic minority participation and achievement in our universities.

Specifically, the Committee was charged to provide the Board with advice, critiques, evaluations and recommendations regarding:

- The current inventory of recruitment and retention programs at each university designed to target under-represented student populations and assist in the achievement of baccalaureate, graduate and professional degrees.
- The comprehensive minority student recruitment and retention plans established at each university in accordance with an additional legislative allocation of $2.5 million for efforts to increase under-represented populations throughout the three universities.
- The implementation of recommendations made by the Regents' Task Force on Excellence, Efficiency and Competitiveness concerning increased minority student recruitment and retention.
- The implementation of goals articulated at both systemwide and institutional levels.
- The relationship of financial aid and access opportunities for under-represented populations.
- Strategies for more effective university outreach efforts into Arizona's communities.
- Strategies for enhancing efforts in working with the Legislature to fund programs that address the commitments called for in this report.
- Formulation of a structure that provides an opportunity for ongoing dialogue with and advice to the Arizona Board of Regents.

The Committee Chair subsequently appointed four subcommittees to study four general areas of inquiry.

The Early Outreach Subcommittee was charged to develop recommendations on what can be done to enhance the readiness of minority students to attend a university, with a particular focus on K-12 system linkages. This Subcommittee was also asked to address how the universities can be more effective in providing information to and interacting with minority communities.

The Recruitment Subcommittee was charged to identify the issues that must be addressed to ensure that Arizona's universities are accessible to students from under-represented populations.

Specific areas of inquiry included financial accessibility, admission standards, community college transfers and minority teacher preparation programs.

The Retention and Graduation Subcommittee was charged to develop strategies to enhance the likelihood of minority students' success to graduation. It also was charged to identify what can be done to encourage minority students to pursue graduate study and academic careers.

The Accountability Subcommittee was charged to develop recommendations to strengthen the accountability processes of the Board and the universities as they relate to the assessment of administrative, faculty and staff efforts and accomplishments to improve the recruitment and retention of minority students and employees.

The work of these Subcommittees and the full Committee has resulted in the issuance of this report. This report marks a beginning, not an ending. The members of this Committee envision a future for the Arizona university system where the strengths inherent in cultural and ethnic diversity are fully integrated into the campuses and where minority students attend and graduate at rates that render the term "under-represented" obsolete.

Introduction

The Challenge for Arizona's Universities

An outstanding university system is basic to the quality of our lives in Arizona. During the past four decades few states have rivaled Arizona in terms of population, economic and cultural growth. Over the course of a single generation, our state's economy has evolved from one dependent on mining and agriculture to new dependence on high technology and service-related industries; a revolution that has propelled the state into a more competitive national position.

Simultaneously, the state encouraged the rapid development of three universities that are now well-positioned on the national scene. The increased size and complexity of each institution has corresponded to expanding state needs for new services in teaching, research and public service. Observers of higher education have noted the energy and optimism of our university faculty, staff and students. At times it seemed that every traditional measurement of university advancement was being reviewed and improved. No traditional measurement of success was trumpeted any louder than the increasing number of students attending our universities.

It is ironic that the focus on "boom times" for Arizona university enrollments during the past twenty-five years has diverted attention from the fact that a significant portion of our population, ethnic minority students, has not shared similar success in entering our universities and completing degree programs.

Despite focused university attention on the recruitment and retention of minority students, particularly during the last five years, the results have been unsatisfactory. While minority enrollments increased from 6,676 in 1980 to 11,304 in 1988, the number of minority graduates increased from 1,192 in 1980-81 to 1,290 in 1987-88, an increase of only 98 graduates systemwide. If Arizona is to be strong both economically and socially during the remainder of this century, the state and its universities must continue to expand initiatives and programs designed to improve significantly university achievement of students from minority groups who are currently under-represented: African-Americans, Hispanics, Native Americans and Asian groups. An increasing minority population, decreasing in-migration rates, an uncertain economy, the need for an increasingly educated and technologically capable work force, and the immense social costs of not improving participation rates are converging trends that motivate us to succeed. We believe that the university system must continue to demonstrate its commitment through action. We recognize that the key to future success will be the creation of partnerships among the university, K-12 and community college systems as well as community-based organizations and the business community.

The Committee has reached several conclusions that underlie the actions called for in our report:

- Arizona's universities must strengthen existing efforts and vigorously develop new, innovative programs if they are to succeed in admitting and graduating increasing numbers of minority students. If they are to be successful in recruiting and retaining additional minority students, the universities must create a campus climate where faculty, administrators and staff work together to accommodate and maximize the strengths inherent in diversity.

- Educational quality and an ethnically diverse student body are compatible goals that can be met simultaneously.

- Comprehensive, institution-wide planning and accountability for performance, combined with leadership that begins with the Board of Regents and each university president, lay the ground work for successful minority student achievement. Such

achievement can be developed only if the principle of minority integration is employed at all levels of university life and is viewed as a desirable goal. Success of minority students is made more probable where the instructional, research, support and administrative systems within the institution include significant numbers of minority faculty, staff and administrators. Achievement of such integration requires the development of an operational blueprint which articulates as its highest priority the recruitment and development of minority faculty, staff and administrators, and the recruitment and graduation of minority students in undergraduate and graduate programs.

- Improved outreach, recruiting, teaching, support services and mentoring are not solely minority issues. When we succeed in improving minority recruitment and retention programs, our successes will ultimately benefit all university students.

Demographic projections and enrollment trends provide a compelling context to our recommendations:

- More than 25% of Arizona's population is comprised of ethnic minorities, including 19% in Maricopa County and more than 27% in Pima County. Of the 1988 college-age cohort (18-25 years), in Arizona, 22% are ethnic minorities.

- Nearly 40% of the children enrolled in kindergarten through third grade are ethnic minorities. By the end of this century, ethnic minority students will make up the majority of kindergarten students in Arizona.

- Minority student attrition continues throughout the elementary and secondary grades. While precise numbers are not available, estimates project that the attrition rate for minority students is significantly greater than the rate for Anglo students.

- In Fall, 1988, the Arizona universities enrolled more than 90,000 students, of whom 11,304 or 12.5% were minority students. Of these, 6.3% were Hispanic; 1.9% were African-American; 2.5% were Native American; and 1.9% were Asian.

- Graduation rates are also disappointing. A recent study by the universities found that for every 100 undergraduate Hispanic students admitted to our universities, it is expected that only 28 will graduate in five years; for African-American students, 22; for Native American students, 14; for Asian students, 45; and for Anglo students, 38. As a function of the total student population, the percentage of minority students receiving baccalaureate degrees during the past six years has not increased.

- Throughout the university system, only 9% of university faculty, 12% of administrators and 11% of professional employees are minorities.

- In Fall 1988 11% of the undergraduate students in the three colleges of education were ethnic minorities. The State Board of Education reports that 11.2% of its employed teachers are ethnic minorities.

These discouraging numbers are not unique to Arizona. The lack of participation of minority students in institutions of higher education is a national problem. Arizona must not rationalize its situation by comparison with national statistics. Rather, we must utilize our educational structure and cultural diversity to be a leader in educational achievement of minority students. An invitation from the Board of Regents to the Committee to discuss, deliberate and deliver a set of recommendations responds to this challenge and has resulted in this report focusing on our common commitment.

House Bill 2108

In 1988, the Governor and some members of the Legislature, who are themselves ethnic minorities, led the effort to appropriate $2.5 million to the three universities for programs directed at recruitment and retention of economically disadvantaged, minority and under-represented students. The universities were required to submit a comprehensive plan to the Board of Regents for distribution of those funds. The plans were to: 1) include programs directed at Arizona resident students, including high school outreach efforts; 2) illustrate the coordination between existing and new recruitment and retention programs; and 3) develop methods for evaluation of program impacts and establish target goals for success. HB 2108 appropriations were to supplement existing university efforts funded from other sources and are being utilized for the following programs:

Early Outreach

Each university proposed to establish public school partnerships to increase the number of minority high school graduates who meet university entrance requirements. UA plans an expansion of the Academic Preparation for Excellence Program (APEX), which emphasizes better preparation in junior and senior high schools, career information and motivation; and Mathematics, Engineering, Science Achievement (MESA), which stimulates greater career interests in those fields. ASU is implementing Project PRIME, a national demonstration program undertaken in cooperation with the College Board and Educational Testing Service. The program will serve 4,500 eighth grade and high school students and provide in-service training to 100 eighth grade mathematics teachers who will implement Algebridge and to 100 tenth grade teachers who will implement Testskills. NAU seeks to strengthen its relationship with high schools, particularly those at nearby Native American reservations. Program examples include a partnership with the Navajo Nation Public School Board and Navajo and Hopi tribes, as well as enhancing long-established early outreach efforts.

Undergraduate Student Recruitment

Each university will seek to increase the enrollment of Arizona resident minority students under goals set by the Board of Regents. UA will increase their high school and community college recruitment programs and increase their scholarships and waivers for minority students. ASU will strengthen its Summer Math-Science Program, Minority Engineering Program, English/Anthropology Program and College of Business Career Options Program, in addition to increasing its high school and community college recruitment programs. NAU will increase the number of minority students reached through a variety of programs, including a Tucson recruitment office, a Native American Recruitment Team, and Arizona Western College transfers to NA-Yuma.

Retention

Each university will increase the graduation rates of Arizona resident minority students. UA will increase its New Start and summer bridge programs and improve its tutoring programs. ASU will further strengthen its STARS program, which seeks to improve the university environment, and improve its tutoring programs for these students. NAU's College of Social and Behavioral Sciences, School of Health Professions and College of Engineering and Technology plan to increase the number of minority student majors. Career planning and financial aid counseling positions will be added, and tutoring programs will also be increased.

Graduate Student Recruitment

Each university will work to increase the number of minority students who enter its graduate programs. UA will develop Graduate College and departmental recruitment materials and strategies

that are targeted to minority students and fund selected departmental recruitment efforts. ASU will increase the amount of funds available for minority graduate students and will work with community college students to encourage them to pursue under graduate education.

The Committee undertook significant discussions concerning the three proposals for two months in the fall of 1988 and recommended changes in the plans relating to: equitable treatment of all minority populations, identification of administrative accountability mechanisms, improved coordination of early outreach and recruitment activities, and identification of objectives and setting recruitment and retention goals that would be measured and tracked. Revised plans were reviewed by the Committee, which recommended their approval by the Board of Regents. Copies of the plans may be obtained from the Board of Regents Central Office. We believe that the continued, coordinated use of these funds will be an important component of future university efforts.

Early Outreach

Linkages and Coordination with the K-12 System and Community Colleges

The Committee was assigned the responsibility for addressing the importance of early outreach initiatives with Arizona's K-12 and community college systems as a catalyst for increasing minority student admissions in Arizona's universities. The Committee was also asked to recommend more effective methods of early outreach.

It is a sad reality that a large proportion of our minority students do not successfully traverse the path to high school graduation. Of those that do, many minority students fall out of the college eligible pool when they follow a non-college-bound curriculum in school. Early outreach initiatives must encourage minority students to consider the importance of acquiring the skills necessary for a college education before they fall behind and provide guidance to those students on such important topics as course selection and academic preparation.

The Committee believes that the universities have faculty and staff whose expertise can be utilized to assist the K-12 and community college systems in their efforts to retain students in school and increase overall levels of academic preparation. The universities must prioritize and target their human and financial resources to form partnerships with school districts. This cooperative effort will enhance the universities' abilities to reach out and assist minority students. Numerous opportunities exist for the universities to enter into partnerships with the K-12 and community college systems through curriculum evaluation, student teaching support, internships, academic program development, college preparatory curriculum advising, internal program evaluation and professional development activities. We believe that the universities should be deliberate and analytical in their efforts to support schools and school districts with high proportions of at-risk students. A mechanism must be established to provide a vehicle for dialogue among the universities and schools to ensure that university resources are being utilized where they will be the most productive.

Successful outreach programs also must involve student participation, particularly students from colleges of education and many of the social science disciplines. While numerous students may be exposed currently to the issues surrounding minority student educational achievement, we believe those students must develop an even greater sensitivity for and understanding of the factors that contribute to academic success.

GOAL

Early outreach programs must be a high priority for the Board of Regents and the universities if admission rates of Arizona minority students are to increase.

RECOMMENDATION 1. The Board of Regents should develop a policy statement outlining its commitment to early outreach efforts in minority communities. Such programs should respect and build upon the strengths inherent in cultural and linguistic diversity. The Board also should direct the universities to adopt a program plan that will implement its commitment. The program plan should document the linkages that each university has or should establish to reach minority students. The program plan should be consistent with the K-12 system plans. It should describe the types of programs that will be undertaken and their impacts on educational and community organizations. Also, it should describe the

method through which the universities and the Board of Regents will monitor program success and measure progress. (See Also: Recommendation 38.)

RECOMMENDATION 2. To evaluate the services the universities are currently offering, the Committee recommends that each university establish an annual profile of partnerships with the K-12 and community college systems and community-based organizations. The profile will be the foundation upon which the universities can strengthen their linkages. The universities should make the profiles available to school districts, community colleges, community-based organizations and members of the public. (See Also: Recommendations 7 and 37)

GOAL

Universities must work jointly with the K-12 and community college systems to prepare minority students for postsecondary educational success.

RECOMMENDATION 3. The Board of Regents should direct the universities to develop a reporting process to ensure that every Arizona community college and school district has an ongoing linkage with at least one of the universities. The report should identify activities for joint development, document systemic barriers and assess the results of the linkages. (See Also: Recommendations 20 and 21)

RECOMMENDATION 4. The Board of Regents and the universities should form an Outreach and Recruiting Coordinating Council comprised of both academic and student affairs administrators. The purpose of this Council will be to coordinate university outreach and recruiting efforts. (See Also: Recommendations 26, 33, and 34)

RECOMMENDATION 5. Greater incentives for participation in public service activities may increase faculty involvement in outreach projects. The Board of Regents and universities should re-evaluate the role of public service and teaching as positive criteria in faculty promotion, tenure and merit pay decisions. (See Also: Recommendations 28 and 29)

RECOMMENDATION 6. The Universities should provide enhanced opportunities to undergraduate students in colleges of education and other professional studies programs for classroom and field-based experiences with culturally diverse populations. These experiences should be related to students' academic programs or courses of study and would develop greater sensitivity to multicultural issues, particularly for those whose professions will result in their working with ethnically diverse populations. All undergraduates in professional programs should be encouraged to participate in academic courses, student teaching assignments, student projects, administrative internships and other projects that provide such experiences. The universities also should provide similar opportunities for all other undergraduate students.

The Committee also reviewed the recommendations of the Regents' Task Force on Excellence, Efficiency and Competitiveness that relate to early outreach activities.

■ **The Task Force recommended that the Board of Regents and the universities establish statewide public school partnership programs in consultation and cooperation with urban and rural school districts and community colleges. The**

goal of the recommendation was to increase minority achievement levels. The Task Force recommended that the success of partnership programs be measured through the use of standardized test scores.

■ The Committee believes in utilizing expanded criteria for evaluation that would recognize that ethnicity and cultural heritage influence test performance. We recommend that the outcome and performance measures of EEC Task Force Recommendation #1 be broadened to: 1) define a critical level of skills that all students, regardless of ethnicity, should attain in order to function effectively at Arizona's universities; and 2) develop measures to evaluate partnership programs and student achievement beyond standardized testing. Such measures should be adopted in conjunction with the K-12 system including the attainment of the Essential Skills Criteria defined by the State Board of Education.

Additional measures could include graduation rates, tracking, attendance and self-esteem profiles. As noted by Dr. David Berliner and Dr. Carlos G. Velez-Ibanez, "Standards for achievement may be met by a variety of cultural and linguistic models depending on the needs of minority and majority students." (See Appendix H)

Linkages and Coordination with Minority Communities

For the universities to increase minority recruitment and retention, there must be a commitment by each university to maintain and enhance a presence within minority communities. Such a presence will help to build trust and credibility between minority and university communities. It will lead to a better understanding of the challenges that are unique to minorities who seek higher education.

Linkages between minority communities and the universities are essential. A common commitment to increasing minority student academic preparation and achievement underlies success in attracting and retaining more minority students to our universities. Community-based organizations, including voluntary organizations, religiously-affiliated organizations, and tribal governments, have invaluable experience and can play a key role in this effort as they have established the attention and respect of their constituencies. The Board of Regents and the universities can benefit from their knowledge and advice, and should consult with representatives from community-based organizations and minority communities regarding the improvement of programs for the recruitment and retention of minority students.

The monitoring and evaluation of new initiatives is of great concern. Programs must be constructed with measurable objectives that give the Board of Regents and the universities an indication of program success or failure. Each partnership program should undergo a periodic, formal evaluation. This component would require that program coordinators build performance measures into the program in anticipation of a formal evaluation.

GOAL

Universities must enhance their ability to reach members of minority communities by working jointly with community-based organizations and tribal governments. These efforts should address the preparation and recruitment of minority students for postsecondary education.

RECOMMENDATION 7. To enhance the success of early outreach efforts, the Board of Regents should develop a policy statement outlining the importance of coordinating actions with community-based organizations. A systematic plan to form partnerships between community-based organizations and universities should be developed. The objective of such a plan should be to create opportunities for community-based organizations and universities to jointly develop and implement programs relating to preparation and recruitment of minority students and other projects of mutual interest. (See Also: Recommendation 2)

RECOMMENDATION 8. In conjunction with the systematic plan, the universities should charge one organizational unit and its head, preferably a vice president, with the overall responsibility for assuring that joint university and community-based organization activities are undertaken in a meaningful way. The vice president should be held accountable for the development and maintenance of these linkages. In addition, the vice president should designate specific individuals or liaisons to community-based organizations. The status of such designated individuals should be sufficient to ensure that the recommendation can produce significant outcomes pertaining to enhancing linkages with community-based organizations. (See Also: Recommendation 37)

RECOMMENDATION 9. Universities and community-based organizations should create mutually beneficial support programs through faculty outreach and consulting, student internships and use of campus facilities. The universities should provide advice and make available in-kind resources to assist in the identification of private funds to support community-based organization outreach and recruitment activities. These programs will serve as a conduit through which the universities can enhance their credibility in the minority community. They also will generate valuable research and work experience for faculty and students. Community-based organizations will benefit from the knowledge of research professionals and the earnest desire of students to learn and contribute.

RECOMMENDATION 10. Each university should develop a process that provides for the systematic review of minority recruitment and retention programs by representatives from community-based organizations. (See Also: Recommendations 38 and 40)

Information

The Committee was charged with determining how the universities could be more effective in efforts to provide information to and interact with minority communities, in efforts to inform the public of the importance of recruiting and retaining minority students, and in efforts to enhance the use of data collected by all three educational systems. We have learned in our deliberations that the effective use of community-based organizational networks will enhance information exchanges.

Second, we believe that projects to be undertaken by the newly created Arizona Minority Education Access and Achievement Cooperative will be crucial to the long-term success of minority achievement programs. The Cooperative is composed of the chief executive officers from the

governing boards of the three educational systems and their additional representatives (See Recommendation Forty). Its mission is to assist the university, community college and K-12 state governing boards and their institutions in the fulfillment of their commitments to improve minority student educational achievement in Arizona through cooperative planning, program development and shared expertise. During summer, 1989, the Cooperative began the development of a statewide plan for minority student achievement and a citizens' information program designed to educate the public about the gravity of failing to improve minority student education. These efforts seek to encourage greater minority student participation and achievement throughout Arizona's educational systems. We support these efforts and look forward to the implementation of their cooperative early outreach, recruitment and information exchange projects.

Finally, the universities must utilize their improved data bases in conjunction with data from the K-12 and community college systems to target resources, to identify student attrition, to establish information baselines and to assess the impacts of their efforts.

GOAL

The K-12 and community college systems and the universities must improve their information systems if they are to plan effective programs to improve minority student participation and achievement.

RECOMMENDATION 11. The State Department of Education, the community colleges and the universities should convene a Technical Task Force to play a lead role in the creation of a comprehensive student tracking system. (See Also: Recommendation 20)

Minority Student Recruitment

One of the most important charges to the Committee was to address barriers to minority student recruitment. Specifically, the Committee was asked to identify issues that must be addressed to assure that Arizona's universities are fully accessible to minority students. We recognize that the current underrepresentation of minority students in the universities will take time to be fully corrected and necessarily will involve all segments of Arizona's educational community working together. We also recognize that the issue of minority under-representation is not a new issue to the universities. Arizonans have been patient with the universities in their attempts to address this serious problem, but the results to date have been disappointing. To achieve their goals, the universities must accelerate their efforts.

We believe that the universities immediately can undertake significant actions in key areas that will enhance current minority student recruitment efforts and then steadily build on these enhancements through the educational and community linkages noted earlier. We have identified four crucial issues that must be addressed if we are to eliminate the under-representation of minority students at Arizona's universities.

GOAL

Financial aid programs must be more accessible and must be increased to address fully the financial aid needs of minority students.

RECOMMENDATION 12. The Board of Regents and the universities should continue to seek new, permanent sources, including a state-funded grant program, for increasing the resources available for student financial aid programs. The establishment of the Arizona Financial Aid Trust is a positive, first step in that process.

RECOMMENDATION 13. The financial aid policies of the universities should clearly articulate the objective of providing necessary resources to students to address fully their financial need for the period reasonably required to obtain a degree. Grants and scholarships are preferred forms of student aid.

RECOMMENDATION 14. Tuition increases should be implemented only if the Board of Regents and the Legislature proportionately increase state financial aid funds. This increased funding is needed to assist students in meeting fully the rising costs of attending the universities.

RECOMMENDATION 15. The universities should expand dissemination of information concerning the availability of financial aid and actively assist students with the application process, giving special attention to providing information directly to students and parents. (See Also: Recommendation 26)

GOAL

Universities must ensure that increased admission standards do not adversely impact minority recruitment; universities should develop collaborative preparatory, enrichment and advising programs to expand the pool of minority students eligible for unconditional admission.

RECOMMENDATION 16. Notwithstanding changes in admission policies, the universities should increase resident minority student enrollment at a compounded rate of 10% per year for the next five years.

RECOMMENDATION 17. The universities should inform Arizona students about admission policy changes and actively recruit minority students who can be admitted to the universities under these policies. The Board of Regents should monitor annually the impact of admission standards on the recruitment of minority students.

RECOMMENDATION 18. The universities should recruit actively minority students who do not meet current admission requirements, and admit such students contingent upon successful completion of a prescribed program of preparatory study.

RECOMMENDATION 19. Universities should require students who transfer fewer than 36 hours of credit and who do not meet unconditional admission requirements on the basis of their high school records and test scores to participate in the same academic support programs as first-time freshman students who are admitted conditionally.

GOAL

Universities should recruit additional community college transfer students, an important source of additional minority students for university enrollment.

RECOMMENDATION 20. The Board of Regents, the universities and the community colleges should develop statistical profiles of community college transfer students. The profiles should be exchanged and utilized as tools to enhance community college transfer recruitment programs. (See Also: Recommendations 3 and 11)

RECOMMENDATION 21. The universities and community colleges should work together to increase the number of community college transfers by establishing transfer centers on community college campuses, entering into cross-registration agreements, identifying minority students who show promise of academic success, developing collaborative programs to target additional K-12 system minority students, and developing on-going working groups to address minority student recruitment and retention issues. (See Also: Recommendation 3)

RECOMMENDATION 22. The Board of Regents and the State Board of Directors for Community Colleges should set a date, preferably by the end of 1990, when articulation agreements among the universities and community colleges will be completed. Articulation agreements should state that students who graduate

from an Arizona community college in a transfer program will enter an Arizona university with upper-division standing and acceptance of general studies credits.

GOAL

University teacher preparation programs should play an important role in addressing the shortage of minority teachers.

RECOMMENDATION 23. The universities and community colleges should encourage students who are planning to major in education to take the Pre-Professional Skills Test (PPST) before the end of their freshman year. Those students who do not attain minimum scores on any section of the test should be assisted in developing strategies to improve their test scores. The strategies developed should include advisement on courses to take during their sophomore year and assistance in test preparation.

RECOMMENDATION 24. The universities' colleges of education should set five-year goals to increase the rates of Arizona minority student enrollment in teacher education programs at a compounded rate of 10% per year. A key component of these goals is the further development of incentives to attract students to teacher education programs, including financial aid assistance.

RECOMMENDATION 25. The State Board of Education should include in its alternative teacher certification program substantial incentives for the recruitment of college-degreed minority professionals to address the serious shortage of minority teachers in Arizona elementary and secondary school districts. The incentives developed should include strategies for the active participation of individual district boards and schools and action-oriented minority outreach efforts.

The Committee also reviewed the recommendations of the Regents' Task Force on Excellence, Efficiency and Competitiveness that relate to minority student recruitment.

- We would strengthen Recommendation #2 that the universities should each achieve a compounded base rate increase in resident minority students of 10% per year per ethnic group for the next five years (See Recommendation 16). In addition, we recommend that the universities also seek to target special efforts at those ethnic minority groups which are particularly under-represented so that the distribution of ethnic minority students in our universities more closely resembles the distribution of the state's population. Moreover, the ultimate goal should be, at the earliest possible date, to eliminate the under-representation of minority students in all academic programs at each university. Individual colleges within each university in which ethnic groups are under-represented should be subject to future performance tracking and to the establishment of college-level goals. The Board of Regents should develop a working agreement with the State Department of Education to obtain accurate K-12 system student statistical profiles to enhance the establishment of minority recruitment goals.

- We concur with EEC Task Force Recommendation #6 that freshman conditions for admission should be increased at the three universities and strongly concur that the Board of Regents should approve only those admission plans that include the implementation of programs that will assist Arizona minority and rural students to

succeed under the plan's requirements. The Board has approved changes in conditions for admission during the time frame of the Committee's work. The Board should require annual reports from the universities to be assured that the programs have been implemented and that minority students are not adversely impacted by rising admission standards.

■ We would strengthen EEC Task Force Recommendation #10 that the Board of Regents and the State Board of Directors for Community Colleges should enhance policies to achieve genuine course equivalency; to decrease further course transfer barriers between the two systems and to eliminate losses of student credit hours resulting from transfers. In addition to these goals, we recommend that both Boards set a date, preferably by the end of 1990, when articulation agreements among the universities and community colleges will be completed (See Recommendation 22). We note the significant accomplishments and continuing work among the universities and community colleges which now makes possible the accomplishment of this goal.

■ We would strengthen EEC Task Force Recommendation #14 that the universities should increase the size of their teacher preparation programs and re-evaluate current testing programs for entrance into professional education programs to eliminate cultural bias. In addition, we recommend that the universities' colleges of education should set five-year goals to increase the rates of Arizona minority student enrollment in teacher education programs at a compounded rate of 10% per year (See Recommendations 23 and 24). We note the Board of Regents' and universities' modification of the PPST current testing program as a positive step toward the elimination of cultural bias in this assessment tool and commend them for instituting academic support strategies for improving the test scores of students.

Minority Student Retention to Graduation

It is our view that university retention activities to date have suffered from two major organizational problems that must be corrected if we are to significantly improve minority achievement in our universities. First, historically, the Board of Regents and the universities have measured their success in minority student achievement in terms of students admitted. While that goal is obviously important, we believe a more significant goal that deserves much greater attention is the number of students who graduate from our universities. Periodic, positive reports of recruitment activities have tended to divert attention from the "bottom line," the passage of graduates into society.

Second, it is our judgment that minority student graduation rates will not improve significantly unless, and until, the Board of Regents and the universities refine their accountability mechanisms to ensure that their academic affairs divisions are primarily accountable for increasing the persistence and graduation rates of minority students. Until university faculty affirm their commitment to support minority student achievement and reward systems are supportive of that commitment, efforts will continue to fall short.

The student services divisions of the universities must retain their critical support roles in enhancing students' persistence to graduation. Their functions must continue to expand, as appropriate, particularly in such efforts as pre-college programs, career planning, professional counseling, tutorial support, cultural programming, mentoring programs, student leadership programs, financial assistance, orientation programs and the development of the campus environment. These services will provide the foundation that will allow students to concentrate their efforts on their primary academic and intellectual pursuits.

Universities and colleges must continue to assess and strengthen their roles in providing supplementary education for at-risk students. Additional facilities and resources should be committed for these efforts.

We also believe that university programs to increase recruitment and graduation of graduate and professional students are extremely important as they ultimately will increase faculty and staff pools. A secondary goal of increased undergraduate retention programs should be the cultivation and enlargement of student pools for university graduate and professional programs.

Universities also should include minority culture and history courses in their general education curricula. Academic departments also should be expected to integrate minority culture and history into their curricula for the benefit of all students.

GOAL

The Board of Regents, universities and each college must improve their retention and graduation rates through the strengthening of the role of their academic affairs divisions.

RECOMMENDATION 26. Universities and colleges must develop and communicate collaborative plans to link recruitment, academic and support services, and financial aid. (See Also: Recommendations 4 and 15)

RECOMMENDATION 27. Universities must structure their accountability mechanisms to ensure that the academic affairs division is primarily accountable for increasing the persistence and graduation rates of minority students and is also accountable for the development and implementation of all academic programs required to achieve those increases.

RECOMMENDATION 28. Universities and colleges must ensure that a high university priority, the improvement of minority student retention, is reflected in faculty and staff reward systems. Resources must be allocated to reward those faculty and staff members who become strongly involved in minority student persistence and graduation programs including student advising and mentoring. (See Also: Recommendations 5 and 39)

RECOMMENDATION 29. Universities must undertake stronger efforts to ensure that trained and experienced faculty and other instructional staff are utilized for teaching at-risk students.

RECOMMENDATION 30. Early warning systems must be strengthened to identify students who are in academic difficulty and to direct those students to the appropriate academic support programs. Those support services, including intrusive tracking and intervention programs, should be available to all at-risk students.

GOAL

The student affairs divisions of the universities and colleges must retain a key supporting role in minority retention programs.

RECOMMENDATION 31. With cooperative efforts from academic affairs divisions, student affairs divisions should be primarily accountable for creating and maintaining a receptive and hospitable campus environment for minority students.

RECOMMENDATION 32. Universities and colleges should ensure that student support services are available to all eligible students. Funding should be stable to make it clear that such programs are integral to the university mission.

GOAL

Universities must recruit and graduate additional minority graduate and professional program students to increase the number of minority university faculty and staff.

RECOMMENDATION 33. Universities and colleges should spend additional resources and time recruiting minority students to graduate and professional programs with an expanded focus on attracting their own undergraduates and alumni, and Arizona citizens. They also should utilize such groups for recruiting assistance. (See Also: Recommendation 4)

RECOMMENDATION 34. Universities and colleges should develop mentoring and research programs for identified minority graduate and professional program students who show promise or interest in academic careers. Additional academic support structures for conference attendance, dissertation support and tutoring also should be explored. Additional time should be spent on academic career awareness programs for talented undergraduate students. (See Also: Recommendation 4)

RECOMMENDATION 35. Universities and colleges should implement incentives for departments that meet goals for retention and graduation of minority students, including graduate and professional program students. The number and amount of minority student fellowships and assistantships also should be increased, particularly for graduate and professional students.

The Committee also reviewed the recommendation of the Regents' Task Force on Excellence, Efficiency and Competitiveness that applied to retention programs. We believe that the goal of retention programs is to amplify the educational achievements of minority students toward graduation. Faculty members play a pivotal role in these programs by setting achievement standards and creating expectations in all students to realize them.

■ We have reviewed EEC Recommendation #3 that calls for the Arizona universities to increase, by fifty percent, by 1995 their graduation rate of students from each under-represented Arizona ethnic minority group. Before commenting on this recommendation, it is important to note that the Committee felt strongly that this goal, graduating more minority students, is the most critical measure of university success.

■ The Committee is also adamant that there be no compromises in quality, in expectations or in qualifications as the universities seek to increase the number of minority students attending and graduating. Our universities and citizens must insist that high academic standards be met. Progress in reaching graduation goals must reflect real increases. Incentive and accountability systems must be designed to ensure that rewards are targeted toward increasing achievement levels while maintaining high standards and expectations.

■ With these thoughts, the Committee agreed with the five-year goal of increasing resident minority student graduation from our universities by 50%. In supporting this recommendation, the Committee recognizes that the data contained in the recent university cohort survival study indicates that meeting this goal will be a challenge. Nevertheless, the Committee recommends that the 1995 timeline adopted by the EEC Task Force be accelerated so that each university will achieve a 50% increase in the number of resident minority students receiving a degree by 1993.

■ The number of minority students graduating from the universities in recent years has fluctuated significantly. To measure the achievement of a 50% increase the Committee recommends that a three-year average be calculated using the number of resident minority students graduating from the universities in 1985-86, 1986-87 and 1987-88. This figure should be used as the baseline to measure whether the graduation goal has been met by 1993. The Committee realizes that attainment of this goal does not require straight-line, equal, year-to-year increases.

Accountability

From its inception, the Committee recognized that improvements in minority access and retention are largely dependent on the extent to which clear, concise and comprehensive accountability measures can be developed and applied to all segments of the university system, including the Board of Regents, presidents, vice presidents, deans, chairs, directors and faculty. The Committee recommends that the following guidelines be applied to assessment of performance in the area of minority access and retention:

- Accountability measures developed by the Board of Regents and the universities should emphasize the responsibility of the university presidents and the executive director of the board as well as other senior administrators such as vice presidents, deans, chairs and directors for meeting fully the objectives of each program or initiative assigned.
- Assessments of minority access and retention accomplishments should be incorporated into the established annual performance evaluation of all senior managers and faculty. Minority access and retention goals should be set at the beginning of the evaluation period and assessment of accomplishments and efforts in this area should be a major category in each performance evaluation.
- The Board of Regents' and universities' goals, efforts and accomplishments in the area of minority access and retention should be published annually and should be made available widely to the public. Annual reports should be standardized among the three state universities; comparative data also should be standardized and should be provided at least by college unit and preferably by academic/administrative unit.
- The Board of Regents and the universities should provide meaningful and effective rewards and incentives to employees and departments that make significant contributions to the accomplishment of minority access and retention goals. The Legislature should be encouraged to be a full partner in this endeavor.
- The Board of Regents and the universities should focus continually on minority access and retention issues and, when necessary, modify and reassess accountability measures to meet changing demands.

GOAL

Measures to assess accomplishments in minority access and retention and affirmative action programs/initiatives should be comprehensive, standardized, quantifiable, provide for senior administrative management accountability, significantly impact individual performance evaluation and compensation, and be distributed widely to the public.

RECOMMENDATION 36. By December, 1989, the Board of Regents should receive action plans from each university to accomplish the recommendations outlined in this Committee report. The action plans submitted should contain specific accountability plans, incorporating at a minimum the features noted in this section of the report.

RECOMMENDATION 37. The Board of Regents should annually receive a minority integration and achievement action plan from each university that outlines measurable goals to be accomplished, provides for senior administrative management accountability, includes an annual report on progress made and goals achieved, and provides for wide distribution of the plans and reports to the public. (See Also: Recommendations 2 and 8)

RECOMMENDATION 38. The Board of Regents should periodically assess its minority integration and achievement strategic plans, programs implemented and achievements accomplished and should consider engaging the services of a nationally recognized, reputable expert group to assist in the assessment. A formalized mechanism for additional independent input from the public, including all ethnic minority groups, should be included in this assessment. (See Also: Recommendations 1 and 10)

RECOMMENDATION 39. By July, 1990, the Board of Regents and the universities should implement a performance evaluation and compensation program that emphasizes accountability and rewards/incentives for accomplishments in affirmative action and minority access and retention programs/initiatives. The programs developed should clearly outline goals, provide for quantifiable measures of accomplishment, and significantly impact the compensation and advancement of employees. (See Also: Recommendations 5 and 38)

An Ongoing Dialogue

Our common commitment to improved minority student educational achievement begins with this report. It is extremely important that the dialogue this report represents be continued.

GOAL

The Board of Regents must create a mechanism whereby regular, ongoing, meaningful communication among the Board, the universities and representatives of minorities is assured.

RECOMMENDATION 40. The Board of Regents should establish an ongoing vehicle for interaction with minority communities. The Board of the Arizona Minority Education Access and Achievement Cooperative should be expanded to include three members from minority communities. A Citizens' Advisory Council should be formed to serve as an advisory group to both the Board of Regents and the Cooperative. (See Also: Recommendation 10)

RECOMMENDATION 41. While the Committee realizes it is the responsibility of the Governor to nominate and the Senate to confirm members of the Board of Regents, the State Board of Directors for Community Colleges and the State Board of Education, it is our strong recommendation that the membership of these Boards reflects Arizona's ethnic diversity.

Future Studies by the Board of Regents

Time constraints did not permit the completion of all studies that would have been helpful to our effort. We recommend that the Board of Regents call for the following studies to be completed within a time frame established by the universities and approved by the Board:

- A determination of the impact of upper-division college admissions requirements on minority student representation.

- An examination of existing, and new and creative approaches to increasing the pool of minority faculty, administrators and staff personnel to include human resource development and retention issues. This study is crucial. We must have role models to facilitate increased minority student participation and achievement in Arizona's universities.

- A study to determine the feasibility and fiscal impact of providing further enrichment and advisement programs for all new students at our universities in need of such support. These programs should assist them in the transition process and improve their academic performance.

- A study of existing and required programs designed to reduce racial tensions on our university campuses.

- A study to determine the number of Arizona high school graduates who are eligible to be admitted to the Arizona universities.

- A study to assess the effectiveness of academic forgiveness policies at each university.

- Future revisions of the recently completed university student cohort study.

- A study of the correlation between admissions requirements and their relationship to academic preparedness levels.

- Anecdotal information indicates that many of Arizona's ethnic minority students who do not qualify for need based financial aid or for academic scholarships are being recruited by universities in other states who are able to offer incentives to these students far in excess of what Arizona's universities can offer. The Committee recommends that a study be undertaken to determine what resources are currently available and what new resources might be identified for the recruitment of in-state minority students to Arizona's universities.

APPENDIX

A. Student Financial Aid Trust Fund Policy

B. New Arizona University System Admissions Policy

C. Amended Arizona University Teacher Education Degree Program and Admissions Policy

D. Inventory of Arizona University Outreach Programs (Executive Summary)

E. Selected Recommendations of the Regents' Task Force on Excellence, Efficiency and Competitiveness

F. Arizona University Student Cohort Study (Executive Summary)

G. Arizona University Admissions/Graduation Rates

H. *Use and Recommendations Regarding Achievement Tests* by Dr. Carlos Velez-Ibanez and Dr. David Berliner

Additional copies of this report and its appendix may be obtained from:

Arizona Board of Regents
3030 N. Central Ave.
Phoenix, AZ 85012

The Arizona Board of Regents and Universities are committed, equal opportunity/affirmative action employers.

The Arizona Universities do not discriminate on the basis of sex, age, race, religion, color, national origin, Vietnam-era veterans' status, or disability in their admissions, employment and educational programs or activities.